

## MSHSL Speech Advisory Committee Minutes

**May 13, 2011**

### Advisory Committee Members:

Rick Purrington, Marshall HS; Joni Anker, Eagan HS; Sandra Wieser-Matthews, Perham HS; Jenn Baese, Lakeville North HS; Cliff Janke, Fairmont HS.

### MSHSL Representatives:

Chris Franson, Assistant Director of the MSHSL;  
Mike Tillmann, MSHSL Speech, Debate, and One Act Play Consultant

#### 1. Action Items

##### a. Count Music Proposal Ballots and Act on Proposal if Necessary

##### **i. Election Results**

**30 votes** = I vote to keep the current music rule as it is written.

**60 votes** = I vote to advance the proposal as written on to the Advisory Committee.

**30 votes** = I don't like the current rule and I don't like the proposal. Leave the current rule as it is for another year (2011-12) and let's revisit it again later.

**1 vote** = I have no opinion or my opinion is not listed here. Feel free to explain your opinion below:

*"I'll let the advisory committee decide. They understand the issue better than I do."*

Based on the election results, the Advisory Committee acted on the proposal. Committee members did revise the original proposal some.

##### **ii. Revised Music Rule Proposal**

1. The use of vocal music (including whistling, humming, and singing) is one of many possible enhancement strategies for a speech. In all events, the vocal performance of music is permitted.
2. The use of music must either be referenced in the stage directions or the directional narrative of the published work (*ex: "John hummed quietly to himself"*) or be specifically published in the work.
3. In categories where selections being performed are written by the contestant, any music that is not original to the performer will be counted as direct quotation.

**This music proposal passed 5-0. It now advances to the MSHSL for Region Committee approval. If it is ultimately passed by the MSHSL Board of Directors, it will be the rule for the 2011-12 season.**

##### b. Act on Informative Visual Aid Proposal

##### **i. Revised Informative Visual Aids Proposal**

The use of visual aids is optional. Visual aids may be two-dimensional and/or three-dimensional but may not violate law (weapons, drugs, for example). The use of animals or any additional people as visual aids is not allowed during the speech. Maximum set-up time is 2 minutes. When set-up is completed or all of the set up time has been used, timing the speaking begins. Expedient take-down is expected. The host school is responsible for communicating any limitations to visual aids dictated by their school policies. The host school is not responsible for providing any facilities, equipment, or assistance in a contestant's use of visual aid.

**This visual aid proposal passed 5-0. It now advances to the MSHSL for Region Committee approval. If it is ultimately passed by the MSHSL Board of Directors, it will be the rule for the 2011-12 season.**

**ii. Citing Visual Aid Sources**

Clarification on citing sources of Informative visual aids was proposed by Mike Tillmann and discussed. The Advisory Committee approved these clarifying edits to the Rules and Policies:

**“All materials quoted, paraphrased, or summarized from other sources (including visuals) must be documented in the submitted script (within the text or in a Works Cited listing or both) and orally and/or visually during the presentation.”**

What this rule clarification means is that sources need to be cited for visual aids. Some speakers may choose to cite the source on the visual aid itself, others may choose to cite it orally in the speech. Either choice is acceptable. The source must also be cited in the written text or in a submitted Works Cited listing.

**c. Act on State Tournament Team Trophies Proposal**

- i. This proposal was **tabled by Advisory on a 5-0 vote** for further study by League staff and MSCA at CTAM this fall. Due to the fact that speech advances individuals to state not teams, the MSHSL would be hesitant to pass the proposal as it was written. So, the Advisory agreed that it would be best to revise the proposal and bring it again when it has a better chance of receiving MSHSL approval. Chris Franson from the MSHSL offered to draft a more specific proposal for MSCA to consider at this fall’s CTAM conference.

**d. Act on Computer Usage in Extemp Speaking Proposal**

- i. No action was necessary as this proposal is current practice and is clarified in the MSHSL’s FAQ’s on the website and in clarifying edits for the Rules and Policies for 2012.

**2. Discussion Items**

**a. Review of New Policies Implemented in 2011**

**i. New State Tournament Scoring**

1. Since the elimination of prelim scores in the ranking of finalists, the increased importance of Final Round judge panels was discussed. One suggestion was to leave more panels open before the tournament to allow for more judge assignment flexibility. This would allow for judges who might have a student in a particular event to potentially judge that event. This may result in a greater opportunity to assign these judges into their top preferences in finals. Another suggestion was to have 5 judges in the final. There are potential issues that come with either of these options but they will be considered and explored further by the MSHSL State Tournament directors.

**ii. New Penalty for Rules Violations**

1. This new policy seemed to be implemented successfully. No major issues were discussed.

**b. Mike’s Miscellaneous Items**

In addition to several clarifying edits to the Rules and Policies, the following questions were raised for Committee advice:

- i. An ISBN is not, technically, proof of print publication [nor does it specify a selection's genre]. What "Proof of Print Publication" should we require? Should we continue to require it? If so,

should originals or photocopies of originals with cutting notations be required? Should the requirement parallel the requirements currently in place for Great Speeches?

1. Mike Tillmann will host a CTAM session to discuss this issue. At Advisory's request, Mike will craft a proposal for MSCA to consider what does not require print publication. The goal is to balance our activity's expectation for literary merit with today's online publishing reality. Most coaches have come to embrace the new Great Speeches rule that loosened the requirements for published speeches to be used in that event. Perhaps our interp events can strike a similar balance?
- ii. In Duo Interpretation, is it the intent that the "no body contact" restriction include or not include the introduction and transitional remarks?
  1. Body contact is allowed in the introduction and/or transitions.
- iii. To what extent must speakers speak *in front of the* contest audience and judge? May a speaker legitimately enter the audience area physically and speak or perform directly to individual audience members? May a speaker move among audience members, though not eliciting their direct reply?
  1. Yes, students can do this at their own risk. However, the instance of an audience member having been purposefully "planted" in a room for the purpose of receiving a direct audience reply is not allowed.
- iv. I received several suggestions that we try writing Discussion Tasks more like Extemporaneous Speaking questions. This might be an item for larger MSCA discussion. What do you think?
  1. The consensus was "no" because Extemporaneous Speaking questions are generally more argumentative than cooperative in nature.
- c. College Forensics Programs on Display at State
  - i. The consensus from Advisory was that publicity booths should be allowed in the commons area but colleges and universities should not have a specific part in the awards ceremony. Scholarships can be sent through the mail

## INFORMATION ITEMS:

- Chris Franson will recommend to the MSHSL Board of Directors the following for 2011-2012 Speech, as selected by the MSCA committees and membership:
  - **Discussion Topic:** "Feeding the World." Outline and Bibliography to be published in early September 2011.
  - **Extemporaneous Reading Books [Same as 2010-2011]:**
    - Prose: *75 Short Masterpieces: Stories from the World's Literature*, edited by Roger B. Goodman. Bantam Books, 1961. ISBN: 978-0-553-25141-8. Specific stories to be announced in early September 2011.
    - Poetry: *The Voice that is Great Within Us: American Poetry of the Twentieth Century*, edited by Hayden Carruth. Bantam Books, 1970. ISBN: 0-553-26263-7. Specific poems to be announced in early September 2011.
  - **Storytelling Book:** *Grimms' Tales for Young and Old: The Complete Stories* Jacob Ludwig Carl Grimm, Jacob W. Grimm, and Wilhelm Grimm. Translated by Ralph Manheim. First Anchor Books Edition, 1983. Copyright 1977. ISBN: 0385-18950-8 or 978-0-385-18950-7. Specific stories to be announced in early September 2011.